AGENDA

Document CC 86 rev.

Submitted for information
ITEM 1 ON THE AGENDA

Implementation Report for 2020-21
Document CC 86/1
Submitted for information

Summary of the implementation progress of the ITCILO P&B for 2022-23
Document CC 86/1/2
Submitted for information
Summary of the implementation progress of the ITCILO P&B for 2022-23

January-September 2022

Board paper CC 86/1/2
The results-based management framework underpinning the ITCILO strategic plan

CROSS-CUTTING STRATEGY DRIVERS:
LEARNING INNOVATION, GEDI, SOCIAL DIALOGUE & TRIPARTISM

TECHNICAL PERFORMANCE
- OUTREACH
- IMPACT

FINANCIAL PERFORMANCE
- REVENUE
- COSTS

ORGANIZATIONAL PERFORMANCE
- STAFF
- CAMPUS
- ICT
- GOVERNANCE

Source: ITCILO 2022-23 P&B

- The focus of this presentation is on result areas marked in red
OUTREACH AND IMPACT

https://www.itcilo.org/data-visuals
OUTREACH AND IMPACT

Share of Training services and non-training services in the Centre's portfolio

Year ➤ 20 SEP 2022

Non-training services 36%

Training services 64%

Source: Management of Activities and Participants (MAP*)
OUTREACH AND IMPACT
OUTREACH AND IMPACT

The universe of beneficiaries of the Centre
January - 20 September 2022

F2F trainees

Distance learners enrolled on the Centre’s e-campus

People engaged via communication and advocacy campaigns

Event participants

Distance learners enrolled on external platforms curated by the Centre

Source: Management of Activities and Participants (MAP), eCampus, Solcomm, External learning platforms curated by the Centre, Social media analytics
OUTREACH AND IMPACT

Q4 outreach is still missing!
Outreach through training activities

Select training modality: Face-to-face training | Distance learning

Click to filter All participants | Employers | Workers | Ministries of labour

2014: 4000 | 2500 | 700 | 500
2015: 4500 | 3000 | 1000 | 400
2016: 4000 | 2500 | 700 | 500
2017: 4500 | 3000 | 1000 | 400
2018: 4500 | 3000 | 1000 | 400
2019: 4500 | 3000 | 1000 | 400
2020: 500 | 500 | 200 | 300
2021: 500 | 500 | 200 | 300
20 SEP 22: 500 | 500 | 200 | 300

Source: Management of Activities and Participants (MAP) eCampus, Soticom n° 2022 Indvcl Dl trainees receiving training via platforms hosted by the Centre included. Before 2018, organizations breakdown were not reported separately based on the training modality.
Outreach through training activities

Select training modality: Face-to-face training, Distance learning

Click to filter: All participants, Employers, Workers, Ministries of labour

Source: Management of Activities and Participants (MAP), eCampus, Solcomm • 2022 Indirect DL trainees receiving training via platforms hosted by the Centre included. Before 2018, organizations breakdown were not reported separately based on the training modality.
OUTREACH AND IMPACT

Training partnerships

Training activities designed/delivered in partnership with the ILO

Training activities designed/delivered in partnership with other training organizations

Source: MAP
OUTREACH AND IMPACT

Training activities by calendar month

Source: Management of Activities and Participants (MAP)
Knowledge application

- Training participants who agreed or strongly agreed that the courses were relevant to their needs
- Training participants who agreed or strongly agreed that the courses translated theory into practice
- Training participants who agreed or strongly agreed that they can apply the knowledge in their work setting
- Training participants who provided concrete knowledge application examples

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Relevant</th>
<th>Theory into Practice</th>
<th>Knowledge Application</th>
<th>Concrete Examples</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2021</td>
<td>95%</td>
<td>92%</td>
<td>94%</td>
<td>57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2022</td>
<td>95%</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>94%</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: External evaluation report, eCampus
ITEM 1 ON THE AGENDA

Implementation Report for 2020-21
Document CC 86/1
Submitted for information

Summary of the implementation progress of the ITCILO P&B for 2022-23
Document CC 86/1/2
Submitted for information
ITEM 2 ON THE AGENDA

Independent external evaluation of the ITCILO online activities

Document CC 86/2

Submitted for information
External evaluation of the ITCILO online training and learning activities: Management response

Board paper CC 86/2
Background of the 2022 evaluation

PURPOSE: To provide management with evidence of outcomes and impact of its fully online training activities, to assess which modalities of online training are most effective and efficient, and to derive recommendations for the improvement and further development of the portfolio.

SCOPE: 20 purposefully sampled online training activities delivered in the course of 2021. The sample included a variety of paid and free, open and tailor-made, tutor-supported and self-guided courses that took place via various platforms using a diverse set of tools, including eCampus, Solicomm, webinars, and virtual reality.

EVALUATION CRITERIA: OECD DAC evaluation principles - relevance, validity of design, effectiveness, efficiency, impact and sustainability.

METHODOLOGY: A combination of quantitative and qualitative evaluation methods. A participant’s survey, in-depth interviews with ITCILO’s staff members, institutional clients and a focus group discussion.

The full evaluation report and a digital brief summarizing the evaluation is accessible via the Board page.
CONCLUSIONS

RELEVANCE: There is a strong sense of appreciation and recognition, shared among the interviewees, that the Center has successfully managed to reach out to its target groups or provide training demanded by its beneficiaries, partners, and donors. Participant survey results clearly indicate that the Center has successfully served its target groups. 95% agreed that the course(s) they had taken in 2021 were relevant to their needs in the work setting. Interviews with client organizations and course participants also confirm that the Centre has effectively played its role in providing ILO constituents with specialized training on different aspects of the Decent Work Agenda via offering online training activities.

OUTREACH: The Centre reached a wider and more diversified audience with online distance learning activities. Especially, participants from middle-income countries can take advantage of digital learning solutions avoiding costs of travel and accommodation. Participants from 128 different countries responded to the survey, with the majority of participants (50%) coming from African countries. Even in the second year of the COVID-19 pandemic, 70% of the participants said they would prefer digital training activities (blended or fully online) in the future, although there is a slight trend toward the demand for more face-to-face learning opportunities for networking. Internet connectivity remains a big problem in many countries. About 50% of participants in Africa, Asia, the Middle East, and Oceania agreed or strongly agreed that they had regular issues with Internet connectivity that disrupted their learning.

VALIDITY OF THE TRAINING DESIGN: The results show that the Centre provides an appropriate mix of synchronous and asynchronous information and communication tools. Participants tend to slightly prefer asynchronous content presentation and communication, which allows for higher levels of flexibility and accessibility. The in-depth analysis of the 20 selected online training activities reveals some room for improvement in terms of teaching, social and cognitive presence and learner engagement.
CONCLUSIONS continued

EFFICIENCY: All reviewed online training activities created revenues, fully covering direct costs in 2021. Staff knowledge and expertise in designing online courses and use of educational media have noticeably increased in 2021, which can also be seen as evidence of the efficiency of the Centre’s overall financial operation regarding staff development. The Centre has continuously made financial investments in its technological infrastructure, primarily focused on improving the pedagogical functions of its main online learning platform, e-Campus, by inserting various technical tools and applications, including the latest VR and AR technology and applications.

EFFECTIVENESS: The online training activities reviewed in this re-evaluation effectively achieved to strengthen the capacity of ILO constituents and other ILO development partners. The Centre has developed a much more sophisticated sense of digital accessibility and inclusion. However, when it comes to “how-to” matters in designing online courses, digital inclusion is not always easy to implement, given the diverse needs of ITCILO’s learner population. In terms of individual learners, 97.4% responded that they would recommend the training activities to their colleagues.

IMPACT: This evaluation measured an impressive 94.3% of participants that agreed or strongly agreed that they can apply what they learned in their work setting. 52% shared a concrete example of their application of knowledge after the online training in an open text question in the survey. Furthermore, the majority of participants reported that they made large or very large improvements in terms of their competencies (68.2%) and job performance (60.7%) as a result of the training activities.
RECOMMENDATIONS

A. Develop a strategic plan on how to best reach their target groups in different regions with appropriate educational technologies and media to get the right mix of synchronous and asynchronous, blended and fully online distance learning delivery that allows for maximum accessibility and outreach.

B. Further improve technical support and provision of advice and information to ensure that participants can easily enroll in and navigate the online courses. The Centre should carefully analyze the procedures and data pertaining to technical support.

C. Review the expected duration, learning hours and number of required tasks to avoid an overwhelming workload for course participants. A clear timetable should always be provided, and distance learners should be given time to catch up in case of falling behind due to work commitments or private obligations.

D. Include a recorded welcome message to introduce the course tutors and course content for all online training activities. Whenever possible, asynchronous forums need to be monitored, and personalized feedback must be offered timely by the tutors. Recordings of synchronous sessions should always be provided.

E. Implement collaborative learning opportunities wherever possible. Group work and discussions must be facilitated and guided by the tutors. All courses should provide participants with an opportunity to formally meet their peers and introduce themselves to other course members.

F. Consider publishing some of the flagship learning materials under a Creative Commons license (e.g., CC-BY). The Center can also develop its own OER policy to support the development and use of open content, which would further increase the visibility and impact of its training courses, and facilitate collaboration among ILO constituents.

G. Develop a more long-term mechanism to evaluate its' financial performance in terms of technological innovations particularly the ones involving the latest VR and AR applications, addressing concerns about the practicality and sustainability of such technology.
H. **Review the staff workload involved in online training activities.** Both an actual increase in online training activities and enrolments and a perceived increase in staff workload voiced by many interviewees in this project need to be carefully reviewed. The economic merits of online training compared to face-to-face training should also be critically reviewed.

I. **Re-think and re-design a staff development mechanism.** The staff with a well-established knowledge foundation for online training would benefit more from just-in-time, personalized, and informal skill development opportunities rather than from one-off training sessions happening at the institution-chosen date and time.

J. **Focus on translating the “idea” or “ideal” of digital inclusion into online training practice by developing a solid understanding of specific circumstances and diverse challenges that restrict both the “access” and “success” of participants’ online learning experiences.** A comprehensive accessibility checklist with brief real-life scenarios and an additional staff position can be created.

K. **Prudently approach educational data mining and profiling, being cautious of unintentionally privileging dominant participant groups.** The Centre should also move from “learner analytics” to “learning analytics” to develop a deeper understanding of how different learner groups engage with learning activities.

L. **Develop a coherent training framework taking into account the full spectrum of online training** including corresponding instructional design templates. While it is important to increase consistency among the Centre’s training activities in terms of their structural and presentational aspects, it is even more crucial to note that the one-size-for-all principle does not work.
MANGEMENT RESPONSE

In response to recommendation A, the Centre will amend the 2022-23 strategy implementation framework of the training department (that operationalizes the 2022-25 strategic plan and the 2022-23 Programme and Budget of the Centre) and specify in further detail how to best reach ILO constituents in different regions with appropriate educational technologies and media. Concrete measures might involve the adaptation and translation of course content, targeted outreach campaigns and ‘mobile first’ learning activities.

In response to recommendation B, the Centre will further refine its existing processes to ensure that participants can more easily navigate between online courses. More in particular, the Centre will cross-reference learning activities by adding relevant links on the course page to other offerings in the catalogue.

In response to recommendation C, has commissioned a follow-up participant survey to refine the expected duration, learning hours and number of required tasks to avoid an overwhelming workload in future course editions. In response to the survey findings, the Centre will communicate at the outset of the learning activity that participants can under certain circumstances ask for additional time to complete module-specific learning tasks. The Centre will also more clearly distinguish between compulsory and facultative readings, and specify the time needed to complete the study of the documents.

In response to recommendation D, the Centre will add to each tutor-supported online activity a recorded welcome message to introduce the course tutors and course content for all online training activities. More in particular, a Moodle plugin will be installed to facilitate the video production by colleagues directly within the eCampus. Asynchronous forums will be more closely monitored, and personalized feedback will be offered timely by the tutors. In future, the Centre will also provide participants with recordings of all synchronous sessions.
In response to recommendation E, the Centre will further emphasize tutor-supported collaborative learning opportunities during online training, with focus on group work and discussions. In tutor-supported courses, participants will always be provided with an opportunity to meet their peers and introduce themselves to other course members.

In response to recommendation F, the Centre will explore in collaboration with the ILO publishing selected flagship learning materials under a Creative Commons license.

In response to recommendation G, the Centre will carry out a cost-benefit analysis of its technological innovations, to better document the potential use case of such technology for constituents.

In response to recommendation H, the Human Resources Services of the Centre together with the Information and Technology and Communication Services of the Centre will commission a staff survey to assess the workload involved in online training activities. Pending findings, the Centre will undertake measures to better distribute the workload in each Technical Programme and across Technical Programmes, to facilitate full compliance with the digital rights of all staff, including the right to disconnect.

In response to recommendation I, the Centre will step up its ongoing programmes to target staff with well-established knowledge about online training with more personalized skills development opportunities. All members of the learning faculty will be encouraged to determine together with their supervisors and HRS their skills development needs and next to submit their individual learning requests via the staff development portal. The Centre furthermore will furthermore continue upgrading its group-based staff development activities with the launch of an in-house training course based on a digital facilitation toolkit developed jointly with the European Trade Union Institute.
In response to recommendation J, the Centre will strive further to make its online learning activities fully inclusive. More in particular, the Centre will introduce an accessibility toolkit to design and deliver online courses mindful of the principles outlined in the publication elaborated after the 2021 digital inclusion summit of the Centre. The e-campus support team will be trained to perform accessibility checks before the course starts. The Centre will furthermore offer its staff training sessions on digital accessibility and facilitate access for Technical Programmes to expert advice on the creation of digitally accessible course content. The Centre will bundle the knowledge accumulated as a result of these follow-up activities and make it available to ILO constituents by way of a digital inclusion laboratory.

In response to recommendation K, the Centre will further upgrade its data analytics processes and tools. More in particular, the Centre will consolidate its data analytics unit in the Office of the Director Training and recruit an additional expert on data-driven services. The knowledge will be made available by way of a self-guided distance learning module on learning analytics and by way of advisory services to Technical Programmes across the Centre and to ILO constituents engaged in the design and delivery of online training.

In response to recommendation L, the Centre will continue along the path of standardizing its online training activities, to increase consistency in terms of the structural and presentational aspects—while leaving space for Technical Programmes to tailor courses to the needs of their respective constituency.

**ITEM 2 ON THE AGENDA**

Independent external evaluation of the ITCILO online activities

*Document CC 86/2*

*Submitted for information*
ITEM 3 ON THE AGENDA

Report of the meeting of the Officers of the Board (May 2022)

Document CC 86/3

Submitted for information
ITEM 4 ON THE AGENDA

Financial Statements and External Auditor’s Report for the year ended 31 December 2021

Document CC 86/4/1

Submitted for information
ITEM 4 ON THE AGENDA

Plan for the audit of the 2022 Financial Statements

Document CC 86/4/2

Submitted for information
Outline

- Mandate and scope of the audit
- Overall audit objectives
- Audit approach and methodology
- Risk perspectives and objectives
- Implementation of Prior Years’ Audit Recommendations
- Collaboration with Office of Internal Audit and Oversight
- Significant audit deliverables
Mandate and Scope

Mandate

Centre’s Financial Regulations, Chapter IX

Scope

Audit of the financial statements of the Centre and on other matters that should be brought to the attention of the Board.
Overall Audit Objectives

To express an independent opinion and to add credibility to the Centre’s financial statements;

To make observations with respect to the efficiency of the financial procedures, the accounting system, the internal financial controls and in general, the administration and management of the Centre (Chapter IX of the Financial Regulations).
Risk-based audit approach guided by the ISA and ISSAI

Financial, compliance, and operations audit
Financial/Compliance Audit

- To assess the Centre’s internal controls to provide assurance regarding the reliability of financial reporting;

- To form and issue an independent audit opinion and add credibility of the financial statements; and

- To determine whether transactions complied with the Centre’s policies, regulations, rules and procedures and legislative authority.
To provide assurance as to whether there were adequate and functioning framework, strategy, policy, and effective controls in the evaluation of the Centre’s training activities, as well as to assess whether the training programmes are achieving their specific objectives.
Implementation of Prior Years’ Audit Recommendations

MONITOR

FOLLOW-UP
Collaboration with Internal Audit

AUDIT AREAS AND COVERAGE

FRAUD CASES
Significant audit deliverables

- Independent Auditor's Report (Short Form Report)
- Report of the External Auditor to the Board of the ITCILO
- Management Letter
- Audit Observation Memoranda (AOM)
ITEM 4 ON THE AGENDA

Plan for the audit of the 2022 Financial Statements

Document CC 86/4/2

Submitted for information
ITEM 4 ON THE AGENDA

Report of the Chief Internal Auditor for the year ended 31 December 2021

Document CC 86/4/3

Submitted for discussion and guidance
ITEM 4 ON THE AGENDA

Follow up to the recommendations of the Chief Internal Auditor for the year ended 31 December 2021

Document CC 86/4/4

Submitted for information
ITEM 5 ON THE AGENDA

Human Resources questions

Document CC 86/5

Submitted for decision

Point for decision: Par. 20
ITEM 6 ON THE AGENDA

Administrative questions

*Document CC 86/6*

*Submitted for information*
ITEM 7 ON THE AGENDA

Report of the Trade Union Training Committee and Report of the Employers’ Training Committee

*Document CC 86/7_a and Document CC 86/7_b*

Submitted for information
ITEM 8 ON THE AGENDA

Date and place of the next session of the Board

The 87th Session of the Board will be held in Turin on 26 and 27 October 2023 just before the 349th Session of the Governing Body of the ILO